Recommendation No.	Recommendation t	Response from the Parking Unit	Observations of Parking and Road Safety Manager	Responsibility for Action	Responsibility for ensuring action	Target Implementation Date	Has been implemented Yes/no	Management System(s)	Further Observations
A01	As parking tickets have been successively numbered, it should be ensured that a detailed record is kept of the distribution of tickets. These tickets should be issued by the Enforcement Manager in order to secure control.	The parking unit has already reviewed arrangements for controlling parking ticket stock in accordance with the recommendation. Our arrangements will secure better control when ticket rolls are distributed in different machines across the County.	Agree with the recommendation	Parking Enforcement Manager	Parking/RS Manager	10/11/11	No		Draft system prepared. This will become operational on 10/11/11
A02	It should be ensured that Security Plus Ltd sends the original copy of the audit trail tickets from inspecting the parking machines they have opened and emptied promptly to the Parking Unit.	It should be noted that the print on the original tickets lose their colour over a period of time. This was explained to the Senior Auditor. A meeting was held with an officer from Security Plus on 25/10/11 to discuss the recommendation. It was agreed that the original audit trail tickets and a photocopy of them would be sent to the Parking Unit within seven days of the collection.		Parking Administrative Supervisor	Parking/RS Manager	26/10/11	Yes	File is kept in the Parking Unit under the control of the Parking Administrative Supervisor	Following the meeting on 25/10/11 Security Plus has begun to send photocopies of the audit tickets, copies of the Schedule and the original audit tickets.
A03	Once arrangements are in place to receive the inspection tickets regularly from Security Plus Ltd, it should be verified that the ticket numbers are in succession for each pay and display machine opened by them, in order to ensure that the collections are complete.	Officers from the Parking Unit have discussed the way forward with Security Plus in terms of ensuring the collections are complete.	Agree with the recommendation	Parking Administrative Supervisor	Parking/RS Manager	26/10/11	Yes	A database has been created to note the audit ticket numbers for each machine managed by the Parking Unit and the Parking Administrative Supervisor.	Security Plus has begun sending photocopies of the audit tickets, a copy of the Schedule and the original audit tickets.
A04	The Parking Unit should check the accuracy of the contents of the schedules attached to the invoices and notify Security Plus Ltd immediately of any changes to the arrangements for collecting from the machines.	The work is now being completed and monitored by the Parking Administrative Supervisor in order to ensure the consistency and accuracy of the invoices. It is believed that our systems for the Parking Unit are acceptable. In terms of the Green Key initiative, it is not the Parking Administrative Supervisor who monitors the Green Key collections. This was being done by Megan Hughes, the Council's Green Key Officer.		Parking Administrative Supervisor	Parking/RS Manager	26/10/11	Yes		This is currently taking place with the Parking Unit's schedule. It is not the responsibility of the Parking Unit to check the Green Key programmes. This is the Green Key Partnership's responsibility.
A05	Effort should be made to pay the invoices within ten days of receiving them in accordance with the Welsh Government's instructions.	The point that there was a need to pay the invoices within ten days was noted. The Parking Manager has discussed the recommendation with the Parking Administrative Supervisor in order to ensure that the invoices are paid within ten working days. It should be noted that difficulties exist through not receiving the money collecting schedule with the invoice from Security Plus. It was explained to the company at a meeting on 25/10/11 that it would need to improve its arrangements in order to synchronise and comply with the agreement.		Parking Administrative Supervisor	Parking/RS Manager	10/11/11	No		Further discussions needed to discuss receiving invoices once the work it completed and ensure consistency

	•	As it was explained to the Auditor, Security Plus sends monthly invoices before hand which is not acceptable. It should be noted, that a number of questions need to be answered by Security Plus in terms of their obligations under the agreement e.g. not receiving a monthly copy of the money collecting schedule. We accept that there are inconsistencies in our current arrangements in paying for invoices within ten days but it must be remembered that invoices cannot be paid for work that has not been completed. We often receive invoices a month before hand and therefore we have to keep hold of them until the work has been completed, which takes more than ten days.					V		
A06	The Parking Unit should use the GCCP Reconciliation reports received from Security Plus Ltd to confirm that the machines have been emptied on time and to highlight any inconsistencies in the total monies collected.	Plus company on 25/10/11, a system is in place to identify any inconsistencies in relation to the total monies collected.		Parking Administrative Supervisor	Parking/RS Manager	1/11/11	Yes	File is kept in the Parking Unit under the control of the Parking Administrative Supervisor	25/10/11 Security Plus has begun sending photocopies of the audit tickets, copies of the Schedule and the original audit tickets on a weekly basis. The Schedules are monitored on a weekly basis by the Parking Administrative Supervisor Should difficulties occur again, we will contact Security Plus immediately.
A07	The Parking Supervisors should download details from the parking machines within the Snowdonia Green Key Initiative area to their PSION for the information to be transferred to the Metric Group system.	Before agreeing to download the details of the parking machines controlled by the Green Key initiative, there will be a need to hold discussions with other partners (GK) e.g. Snowdonia National Park before undertaking the work.	 It should be noted that the Parking Unit is not responsible for managing/servicin g the Snowdonia Green Key Initiative (SGKI) pay and display machines. The SGKI is a partnership between Gwynedd Council and Snowdonia 	Senior Transportation and Street Care Manager / Parking Manager	Parking/RS Manager	20/11/11	No		There will be a need to hold discussions with all the partners to decide whether or not it's possible to act in accordance with the recommendation.

			National Park.						
A08	It should be ensured that the Green Key Initiative pay and display parking machines are incorporated and reconciled with the Metric Group parking system.	It is accepted that reconciliation is important in terms of maintaining and collecting money from all of the Council's pay and display machines. There will be a need to discuss any changes with Green Key officers and other partners (as above) before considering this measure.	There will be a need to discuss changes with SGKI officers before changing the current arrangement	Senior Transportation and Street Care Manager / Parking Manager	Parking/RS Manager	20/11/11	No		For information – Green Key do not have a Machines contract with Metric, therefore information cannot be downloaded from PSION and synchronised with the Schedule.
A09	In order to ensure consistency of the income monitoring arrangements within the parking field it should be ensured that the parking machines within the Snowdonia Green Key Initiative area are placed under the supervision of the Parking Unit at Bangor Town Hall.	regarding this matter.	There will be a need to discuss any changes with SGKI before changing the current arrangement	Senior Transportation and Street Care Manager / Parking Manager		20/11/11	No		
A10	Security Plus Ltd should be instructed to notify the Parking Unit and not the Parking Supervisors if they discover a defective machine. The Supervisors themselves should also promptly notify the Parking Unit if they discover defective machines.	Security Plus, it was agreed to change the arrangements.		Enforcement Manager/ Parking Administrative Supervisor	Parking/RS Manager	26/10/11	Yes		 Parking officers have met with Security Plus on 25/10/11 to discuss the matter; they have agreed to directly contact the Parking Unit (back office) by phone and e-mail. Parking Enforcement Officers have been instructed to let the back office know of any machine defects.
A11	The Parking Unit should instruct Security Plus Ltd to include the numbers of the audit trail tickets on the reconciliation sheet.	Following the 25/10/11 meeting with Security Plus, further arrangements are in place to change the procedure. The Security Plus company has agreed to include audit numbers on the reconciliation sheet.		Parking Administrative Supervisor	Parking/RS Manager	26/10/11	Yes	Parking Administrative Supervisor to monitor on a weekly basis.	
A12	The Environment Group Finance Unit should receive monthly reports of cases where Parking Unit officers have cancelled fines. A sample of cancelled fines should be selected to provide an explanation and justification of the reasons for cancelling the fines.	Meeting has taken place with the Environment Finance Manager, the Parking Administrative Supervisor and the Parking Manager to discuss creating a system for sample testing fines that have been cancelled. There will be a need to revise the current system (Si-Dem) for this action.	Agree with the recommendation	Parking Administrative Supervisor/Parking Manager/RS		1/12/11	No		 Initial discussions have taken place between Spur (1/11/11) and the Wales Penalty Processing Partnership to create a system to implement the recommendation There will be costs involved with implementing

									this action It should be noted that sample testing is already available by the WPPP and in order to create a unique system for Gwynedd, there will be a need to establish new processes.
A13	The Environment Group Finance Unit and the Parking Unit should reconcile the income that appears on the Si-Dem Debt Management System with the income as it appears on the Council's ledger at the end of the financial year.	 Discussions have taken place between the Parking Manager/RS and the Environment Finance Manager to ensure the implementation of the recommendation. The current system will need to be amended (Si-Dem) for this action. 	Agree with the recommendation	Parking Administrative Supervisor/Parking Manager/RS		1/12/11	No		Initial discussions have taken place with WPPP to enable the finance department to use the system.
A14	The Parking Unit should deposit the money received at Barclays Bank in Bangor at least once a week.	 Occasionally, some parking fine payments are made at Bangor Town Hall. We accept that we need to improve our banking arrangements in accordance with the Auditor's recommendation. 	Agree with the recommendation	Parking Administrative Supervisor	Parking/RS Manager	26/10/11	Yes	Parking Administrative Supervisor to bank the money.	Back Office staff have been briefed
A15	It should be ensured that the on-street parking fines are coded to the KP71 8322 account and fines for illegal parking in car parks are coded to the KP31 8314 account.	the Parking Administrative Supervisor.	Agree with the recommendation	Parking Administrative Supervisor	Parking/RS Manager	26/10/11	Yes	Parking Administrative Supervisor ensures that the coding is correct.	It should be noted that this has been undertaken since 07/03/2011, before the end of the audit. The fines have been coded correctly.

ACTION PLAN MENAI CENTRE BANGOR CAR PARK AGREEMENT

APPENDIX 2

	Recommendation	Response from the Parking Unit	Observations of	Responsibility for	Responsibility for	Target	Has been	Management	Further Observations
Recommendation No.			Parking and Road Safety Manager	Action	ensuring action			System(s)	
A1	Menai Centre Car Park's final account should be requested from Cathco in order to identify whether money is payable to the Council in accordance with the profit share clause of any capital savings from asset buildings.	how the Council could identify the money		Corporate Property Manager	Head of Customer Care Department	31/03/2011	Yes		Discussions and agreements have developed considerably during the past week.
A2	Thorough financial assessments of the companies' accounts should be undertaken before the Council ventures into a financial contractual relationship.	a number of companies have suffered		Commissioning Officers	-	From now on	Yes		
A3	A rent pay day should be applied in any lease between Gwynedd Council and a third party.		Agree with the recommendation	Solicitors	Head of Democracy and Legal Department	From now on	Yes		
A4	A standard clause should be included in Gwynedd Council leasehold agreements to ensure that rent is received beforehand unless there is a sufficient reason to receive the rent arrear in accordance with the Council's Financial Procedural Rules.			Corporate Property Manager and the Solicitors	Head of Customer Care and Head of Democracy and Legal	From now on	Yes		
A5	It should be ensured that any periodic invoices are raised on a Debt System on the Ledger.		Agree with the recommendation	Finance Units	Head of Finance Department	From now on	Yes		
A6	The Administrators should be notified that Menai Centre Car Park (Dean Street) is a leasehold not a freehold in order to amend the Statement of the Administrator's Proposal'.	No response required	Agree with the recommendation	Solicitors	Head of Democracy and Legal Department	31/03/2011	Yes		
A7	Any further discussions and correspondence regarding Menai Centre Car Park should be held through the Council's Land and Property Service and the Legal Service.	intention.	Agree with the recommendation	Corporate Property Manager	Head of Customer Care Department	From now on	Yes		

ACTION PLAN INTEGRATED TRANSPORT UNIT

Recommenda tion No.	Recommendation	Response from the Integrated Transportation Unit	Observations of Integrated Transport Unit Manager		Responsibility for ensuring action	Target Implementatio n Date	Has been implemente d Yes/no	Management System(s)	Further Observations
A01		higher than expected and in the opinion of the Manager and the Senior Manager do not offer value for money. This should be looked at in more detail.	Agree with the recommendation	Integrated Transport Unit Manager	Chief Engineer – Transportation and Street Care	31/12/2011	Yes	In the process of improvement through the new Integrated Transport Unit.	A lot of work to be done to gain order and demonstrate value for money. It had proved difficult in the past to challenge the unit's work.
	serve areas that otherwise would not be able to maintain services through tender or commercially; (2) in order to buy Sunday routes, or night routes from the company which operates the route commercially during peak hours, or (3) to purchase small works up to £6,000 a year.		Agree with the recommendation						
	It should be ensured that there is justification and evidence on the Unit's agreement files (which are set through tender or de-minimis) in order to show transparency of how and why the agreement has been awarded.	Agreed.	Agree with the recommendation						
	Education agreements are not subject to the Transportation Act and therefore the deminimis clause is not relevant to these agreements. It is likely that a number of existing education agreements have been awarded contrary to procurement regulations.	Agree that a procedure is needed for this.	Agree with the recommendation						
A02	It should be ensured that there is adequate justification to provide companies with a deminimis subsidy so that Gwynedd Council is not accused of showing preference to some companies. See recommendation A01 also.		Agree with the recommendation	Integrated Transport Unit Manager	Chief Engineer – Transportation and Street Care	31/12/2011	Yes		
A03	Any decision to provide any company with a subsidy to run a bus route should be justified by considering factors such as the route's population, social area, other public transport routes in the area and an over-bussing situation.		Agree with the recommendation	Integrated Transport Unit Manager	Chief Engineer – Transportation and Street Care	31/12/2011	Yes		
	The Unit should ensure that Gwynedd Council's list of public transport agreements demonstrates exactly which routes receive a de-minimis subsidy and which group receive a subsidy by tender.	developed on this.							
A04	Precaution is needed in setting de-minimis agreements with companies due to the 'gaming' risk when a company local to the route or a company which already operates the route automatically receives the subsidy. Providing justification on file as evidence of the award is essential in order to display transparency.		Agree with the recommendation	Integrated Transport Unit Manager	Chief Engineer – Transportation and Street Care	31/12/2011	Yes		
	The Unit should prepare a Strategy on Gwynedd Council's vision and direction regarding the area's public transport. Following this, detailed policies should be developed as an appendix to the Strategy as a guide to officers in order to decide whether it is beneficial to offer a subsidy to a specific		Agree with the recommendation				Yes		This has been included in the new Unit's Business Plan

	route as well as what kind of subsidy is suitable – de-minimis or an open tender competition.								
A05	It should be ensured that there is evidence on file to justify the de-minimis agreements' value for money.		Agree with the recommendation	Integrated Transport Unit Manager	Chief Engineer – Transportation and Street Care	31/12/2011	Yes		
A06	It should be ensured that a formal Agreement document is the basis of any contractual relationship between Gwynedd Council and the bus companies. Public Transport Unit agreements should be reviewed in order to ensure that they are now fit for purpose.		Agree with the recommendation	Integrated Transport Unit Manager	Chief Engineer – Transportation and Street Care	31/12/2011	Yes	l t	ome contracts have already been resolved. Much more eeds to be done by the Unit to complete the task.
A07	De-minimis agreements should not be in place for more than a maximum of five years.	Agreed	Agree with the recommendation	Integrated Transport Unit Manager	Chief Engineer – Transportation and Street Care	31/12/2011	Yes		
A08	Officers should be reminded of the Unit's internal arrangements when completing agreements (i.e. only the Chief Engineer-Transportation and Street Care to sign agreements under £50,000) and also the procedure for sealing Gwynedd Council agreements for work over £50,000. When calculating an agreement, the value of the agreement's duration should be calculated rather than the value of payments under the agreement for a year.	existed where a member of staff did not comply with the instruction issued.	Agree with the recommendation	Integrated Transport Unit Manager	Chief Engineer – Transportation and Street Care	01/04/2011	Yes		Clear instruction has been given to staff in relation to complying with this directive